

Defending Civilization:

HOW OUR UNIVERSITIES ARE FAILING AMERICA
AND WHAT CAN BE DONE ABOUT IT

*At a time of national crisis, I think it is particularly
apparent that we need to encourage the study of our past.
Our children and grandchildren—indeed, all of us—need
to know the idea and ideals on which our nation has been built.*

*We need to understand how fortunate we are to live
in freedom. We need to understand that living in liberty
is such a precious thing that generations of men and women
have been willing to sacrifice everything for it.
We need to know, in a war, exactly what is at stake.*

– Lynne V. Cheney, October 5, 2001

A Project of the Defense of Civilization Fund

American Council of Trustees and Alumni

Jerry L. Martin

Anne D. Neal

November 2001

Acknowledgments

This report was prepared by the staff of the American Council of Trustees and Alumni, primarily by Anne D. Neal and Jerry L. Martin. Special thanks go to The Randolph Foundation, the William and Karen Tell Foundation and Jane H. Fraser for their support of this effort.

The American Council of Trustees and Alumni is an educational nonprofit based in Washington, D.C. dedicated to academic freedom, quality and accountability. ACTA has also published *Losing America's Memory: Historical Illiteracy in the 21st Century* (2000); *The Shakespeare File: What English Majors Are Really Studying* (1996); and *The Intelligent Donor's Guide to College Giving* (1996).

At this critical time in our history, ACTA has launched the Defense of Civilization Fund. The Fund will be used to support and defend the study of American history and civics and of Western civilization. The Fund's first project is this report.

For further information about ACTA and its programs, please contact:

American Council of Trustees and Alumni
1726 M Street, NW, Suite 800
Washington, DC 20036
Telephone: 202-467-6787; 1-888-ALUMNI-8
Facsimile: 202-467-6784
Email: info@goacta.org
Internet: <http://www.goacta.org>

Defending Civilization:

HOW OUR UNIVERSITIES ARE FAILING AMERICA AND WHAT CAN BE DONE ABOUT IT

In the wake of the September 11 terrorist attacks, Americans across the country responded with anger, patriotism, and support of military intervention. The polls have been nearly unanimous—92% in favor of military force even if casualties occur—and citizens have rallied behind the President wholeheartedly.

Not so in academe. Even as many institutions enhanced security and many students exhibited American flags, college and university faculty have been the weak link in America's response to the attack. Proving a shocking divide between academe and the public at large, professors across the country sponsored teach-ins that typically ranged from moral equivocation to explicit condemnations of America.

While America's elected officials from both parties and media commentators from across the spectrum condemned the attacks and followed the President in calling evil by its rightful name, many faculty demurred. Some refused to make judgments. Many invoked tolerance and diversity as antidotes to evil. Some even pointed accusatory fingers, not at the terrorists, but at America itself.

College and university faculty have been the weak link in America's response to the attack.

Leaders from Both Parties

President George W. Bush: “In this conflict, there is no neutral ground. If any government sponsors the outlaws and killers of innocents, they have become outlaws and murderers, themselves. And they will take that lonely path at their own peril.”

Joint Statement by Senate Majority Leader Tom Daschle and Minority Leader Trent Lott: “What happened on Tuesday, September 11th, was not simply an attack against America. It was a crime against democracy, and decency. It was a crime against humanity.”

New York City Mayor Rudolph Giuliani: “This was not just an attack on the City of New York or on the United States of America. It was an attack on the very idea of a free, inclusive, and civil society. ... On one side is democracy, the rule of law, and respect for human life; on the other is tyranny, arbitrary executions, and mass murder. We’re right and they’re wrong. It’s as simple as that.”

Voices on Campus

Hugh Gusterson, professor of anthropology and science and technology studies, Massachusetts Institute of Technology: “[I]magine the real suffering and grief of people in other countries. The best way to begin a war on terrorism might be to look in the mirror.”

Michael Rothschild, Dean of the Woodrow Wilson School, Princeton University: “There is a terrible and understandable desire to find and punish whoever was responsible for this. But as we think about it, it’s very important for Americans to think about our own history, what we did in World War II to Japanese citizens by interning them.”

Professional Staff Congress, City University of New York: “[Students and teachers] do not need to be fighting against fellow-workers under other flags and gods but rather against their own corporate or government employers.”

Kevin Lourie, professor of anthropology, Brown University School of Medicine: “[T]his war can end only to the extent that we relinquish our role as world leader, overhaul our lifestyle and achieve political neutrality.”

Rarely did professors publicly mention heroism, rarely did they discuss the difference between good and evil, the nature of Western political order or the virtue of a free society. Their public messages were short on patriotism and long on self-flagellation. Indeed, the message of much of academe was clear: BLAME AMERICA FIRST.

William Keach, professor of English, Brown University: “What happened on September 11 was terrorism, but what happened during the Gulf War was also terrorism.”

Speaker at Haverford College meeting: “We are complicit.”

Richard Berthold, professor of history, University of New Mexico: “Anyone who can blow up the Pentagon gets my vote.”

Journalist William Blum at University of North Carolina teach-in: “If I were the president, I would first apologize to all the widows and orphans, the tortured and the impoverished, and all the millions of other victims of American imperialism.” “[T]here are few if any nations in the world that have harbored more terrorists than the United States.”

Barbara Foley, professor of English, Rutgers University: “[W]e should be aware that, whatever its proximate cause,

Their public messages were short on patriotism and long on self-flagellation. Indeed, the message of much of academe was clear: BLAME AMERICA FIRST.

Many invoked tolerance and diversity as antidotes to evil. Some even pointed accusatory fingers, not at the terrorists, but at America itself.

its ultimate cause is the fascism of U.S. foreign policy over the past many decades.”

Walter Daum, mathematics instructor, at City University of New York teach-in: “The ultimate responsibility lies with the rulers of this country, the capitalist ruling class of this country.”

Noam Chomsky at MIT: “[T]he only way we can put an end to terrorism is to stop participating in it.”

Jennie Traschen, professor of physics, University of Massachusetts-Amherst: “[The American flag is] a symbol of terrorism and death and fear and destruction and oppression.”

Robert Jensen, professor of journalism, University of Texas-Austin: “[The terrorist attack] was no more despicable than the massive acts of terrorism ... that the U.S. government has committed during my lifetime.”

Haunani-Kay Trask, professor of Hawaiian studies, University of Hawaii: “Why should we support the United States, whose hands in history are soaked with blood?”

These are only a few of the more than a hundred statements documented here. And they are in pointed contrast to America’s reaction in 1941: “Everyone wanted to cooperate and feel like they were helping the country,” said Elmer Cornwell, professor of political science at Brown University. “When Pearl Harbor was bombed there was a tremendous swell of patriotism,” recalled Brown physics professor Leon Cooper, the Thomas J. Watson Sr. professor of science. “One thing outsiders don’t always understand about the United States is we’re a fractious nation but we come together during times like these.”

But, after September 11, it was higher education that did not understand. Although most faculty presumably shared

America’s horror and condemnation of the terrorist attacks, many did not. And while professors should be passionately defended in their right to academic freedom, that does not exempt them from criticism. The fact remains that academe is the only sector of American society that is distinctly divided in its response. Indeed, expressions of pervasive moral relativism are a staple of academic life in this country and an apparent symptom of an educational system that has increasingly suggested that Western civilization is the primary source of the world’s ills—even though it gave us the ideals of democracy, human rights, individual liberty, and mutual tolerance.

Until the 1960s, colleges typically required students to take surveys of Western civilization. Since then, those surveys have been supplanted by a smorgasbord of often narrow and trendy classes and incoherent requirements that do not convey the great heritage of human civilization. Accompanying this basic failure is an atmosphere increasingly unfriendly to the free exchange of ideas. Students have reported more and more that they are intimidated by professors and fellow students if they question “politically correct” ideas or fail to conform to a particular ideology. In some cases, students have even been subject to official sanctions for speaking their minds in class. So pervasive is the climate of intimidation one New York reporter covering a City University of New York teach-in recounted the piteous tale of a student who feared retribution. “‘My grade depends on a lot of the professors who spoke,’ the student explained. ‘If you voice an opinion of dissent, professors look down on you.’”

Students and often professors, especially if they are untenured, are reluctant to question publicly the dominant campus ideology. In light of this campus climate, it is not surprising that often the students who feel free to speak out are those who oppose the war on terrorism. According to the *New York Times*, students at more than 146 campuses in 36 states had rallied to urge the country to avoid any military response.

It is urgent that students and professors who support the

And while professors should be passionately defended in their right to academic freedom, that does not exempt them from criticism. The fact remains that academe is the only sector of American society that is distinctly divided in its response.

...expressions of pervasive moral relativism are a staple of academic life in this country...

war effort not be intimidated. If both sides are heard, students and all of us benefit. Where the faculty is so one-sided that there are no campus voices to oppose them, visiting speakers should be brought in so that students will hear both pros and cons.

Ironically, instead of ensuring that students understand the unique contributions of America and Western civilization—the civilization under attack—universities are rushing to add courses on Islamic and Asian cultures. UCLA created 50 new courses in response to the terrorist attacks while other institutions expanded existing offerings. It is indeed important that Americans know about the ideas and achievements of all the world's cultures. But in the rush to add courses, these institutions frequently reinforced the mindset that it was America—and America's failure to understand Islam—that were to blame. "To say that it is more important now [to study Islam] implies that the events of Sept. 11 were our fault, that it was our failure ... that led to so many deaths and so much destruction," said the American Council of Trustees and Alumni's founding chairman Lynne V. Cheney in a speech on October 5. Instead, said Cheney, students need to "know the ideas and ideals on which our nation has been built. ... If there were one aspect of schooling from kindergarten through college to which I would give added emphasis today, it would be American history."

America's first line of defense is a confident understanding of how and why this nation was founded, and of the continuing relevance and urgency of its first principles. It depends on its intellectuals both for its philosophical defense and for passing its heritage on to the next generation. Yet America's elite college students are graduating woefully ignorant of the foundations of Western civilization as well as American history and its founding.

In a study by the American Council of Trustees and Alumni, *Losing America's Memory: Historical Illiteracy in the 21st Century*, ACTA found that students can now graduate from 100% of the top 55 colleges without taking a single course in American history. Of those same institutions, a mere handful—only three—required a course on the history of Western civilization,

while 77% permitted students to graduate with no history at all.

We learn from history that when a nation's intellectuals are unwilling to defend its civilization, they give aid and comfort to its adversaries. In 1933, the Oxford Student Union held a famous debate over whether it was moral for Britons to fight for king and country. After a wide-ranging discussion in which the leading intellectuals could find no distinction between British colonialism and world fascism, the Union resolved that England would "in no circumstances fight for king and country." As the *Wall Street Journal* reported: "Von Ribbentrop sent back the good news to Germany's new chancellor, Hitler: The West will not fight for its own survival."

We believe that the West will fight for its own survival. But only if we know what we are fighting for. It has never been more urgent for education at all levels to pass on to the next generation the legacy of freedom and democracy. We call upon all colleges and universities to adopt strong core curricula that include rigorous, broad-based courses on the great works of Western civilization as well as courses on American history, America's Founding documents, and America's continuing struggle to extend and defend the principles on which it was founded. If institutions fail to do so, alumni should protest, donors should fund new programs, and trustees should demand action. What is not taught will be forgotten, and what is forgotten cannot be defended. Lynne Cheney has put it best:

*At a time of national crisis, ...
we need to encourage the study of our past.
Our children and grandchildren—indeed, all of us—need
to know the idea and ideals on which our nation has been built.
We need to understand how fortunate we are to live
in freedom. We need to understand that living in liberty
is such a precious thing that generations of men and women
have been willing to sacrifice everything for it.
We need to know, in a war, exactly what is at stake.*

“... If there were one aspect of schooling from kindergarten through college to which I would give added emphasis today, it would be American history.”

We call upon all colleges and universities to adopt strong core curricula that include rigorous, broad-based courses on the great works of Western civilization...

Public and Campus Responses

In the weeks following the terrorist attacks, there have been literally hundreds and thousands of reactions. Polls across the country, coupled with statements from public officials and citizens, have been remarkably uniform in their condemnation of the terrorist attacks and support of a military response. A sampling of that response follows.

At the opposite extreme has been reaction from the Ivory Tower. While there are no doubt numerous exceptions, a vast number of colleges and universities—public and private, small and large, from all parts of the country—have sponsored teach-ins and other fora which have been distinctly equivocal and divided in their response.

Let us be clear. This is not an argument for limiting free speech on college campuses. Indeed, the robust exchange of ideas is essential to a free society. But it is equally important—and never more so than in these unsettling times—to insist that colleges and universities transmit our history and heritage to the next generation. Academic freedom does not mean freedom from criticism.

Although the following examples, over 100 in number, are not intended to be exhaustive, they represent campus responses—as reported in the media—in the months following the attacks.

...the robust exchange of ideas is essential to a free society. But it is equally important—and never more so than in these unsettling times—to insist that colleges and universities transmit our history and heritage to the next generation. Academic freedom does not mean freedom from criticism.

The American Public:

Americans Should Take Military Action Even If Casualties Occur – 92%

New York Times/CBS Poll, reported in “Poll Finds Support for War and Fear on Economy,” *New York Times*, Sept. 25, 2001

Harvard Students:

America Should Take Military Action – 69%

America Should Take Military Action Even If Casualties Occur – 28%

“Students Back Response,” *Harvard Crimson*, Sept. 24, 2001

College Students Generally:

America Should Undertake Air Strikes – 79%

America Should Use Ground Troops – 68%

“New Harvard Poll indicates firm support for war on college campuses,” by Associated Press, Nov. 1, 2001, reporting on nationwide survey conducted by Institute of Politics at the Kennedy School of Government

Public Response

President George W. Bush: “On September the eleventh, enemies of freedom committed an act of war against our country. Americans have known wars, but for the past 136 years, they have been wars on foreign soil, except for one Sunday in 1941. Americans have known the casualties of war but not at the center of a great city on a peaceful morning. Americans have known surprise attacks but never before on thousands of civilians. All of this was brought upon us in a single day, and night fell on a different world, a world where freedom itself was under attack.” Speech Before a Joint Session of Congress, Sept. 20, 2001

President George W. Bush: “In this conflict, there is no neutral ground. If any government sponsors the outlaws and killers of innocents, they have become outlaws and murderers, themselves. And they will take that lonely path at their own peril.” The White House Treaty Room, Oct. 7, 2001

Joint Statement by Senate Majority Leader Tom Daschle and Minority Leader Trent Lott: “What happened on Tuesday, September 11th, was not simply an attack against America. It was a crime against democracy, and decency. It was a crime against humanity. ... On Wednesday, we unanimously passed a joint resolution condemning the attacks, expressing our sympathy for the victims and their families, and stating our support for the President as Commander-in-Chief.”
www.senate.gov/leaders/statement

New York City Mayor Rudolph Giuliani: “This was not just an attack on the City of New York or the United States of America. It was an attack on the very idea of a free, inclusive, and civil society.

... Look at that destruction, that massive, senseless, cruel loss of human life ... and then I ask you to look in your hearts and recognize that there is no room for neutrality on the issue of terrorism. You're either with civilization or with terrorists.

On one side is democracy, the rule of law, and respect for human life; on the other is tyranny, arbitrary executions, and mass murder.

We're right and they're wrong. It's as simple as that. ...

... The era of moral relativism between those who practice or condone terrorism, and those nations who stand up against it, must end. Moral relativism does not have a place in this discussion and debate.”

Opening Remarks to the United Nations General Assembly Special Session on Terrorism, Oct. 1, 2001, www.nyc.gov

Campus Responses

1. **Freelancer Peter Zedrin at Brown University protest:** “I was cheering when the Pentagon got hit because I know about the brutality of the military. The American flag is nothing but a symbol of hate and should be used for toilet paper for all I care.”

2. **Elin O’Hara Slavick, professor of art, at University of North Carolina teach-in:** “We offer this teach-in as an alternative to the cries of war and as an end to the cycle of continued global violence.”

3. **Panelist Stan Goff at University of North Carolina teach-in:** “We will tumble from chauvinism into the abyss of recession and tribalism.”

4. **Kevin Lourie, professor of anthropology, Brown University School of Medicine:** “[T]his war can end only to the extent that we relinquish our role as world leader, overhaul our lifestyle and achieve political neutrality. ... Perhaps our best options now are to search for the origins of this new war, draw strength from understanding our own weaknesses, and make changes within ourselves and within our relationships to others. Many wonder if we are paying an accumulated debt for centuries of dominance and intervention far from home, retribution for our culture of consumption and exploitation. ... We must ... re-examine our place in the world, and begin to imagine a world without super-powers.”

5. **Adil Najam, Tufts University professor of international relations, at Brown University panel discussion:** “...the U.S. was basically using Pakistan the way you use a condom. That is, you use the condom to avoid getting dirty, but then you throw the condom away after you’ve used it and don’t think about it again—well, the condom certainly thinks about it.”

6. **William Keach, professor of English, Brown University:** “What happened on September 11 was terrorism, but what happened during the Gulf War was also terrorism.”

7. **Walter Daum, mathematics instructor, at City University of New York teach-in:** “The ultimate responsibility lies with the rulers of this country, the capitalist ruling class of this country.”

8. **George Lakoff, professor of linguistics, University of California-Berkeley:** “...the planes [were] penetrating the towers with a plume of heat. The Pentagon, a vaginal image from the air, penetrated by the plane as missile.”

9. **Lehigh University vice provost bans the American flag on the University bus on the grounds that it is insensitive to foreign students. After a public outcry, the University retracts the policy.**

10. **Hugh Gusterson, professor of anthropology and science and technology studies, Massachusetts Institute of Technology:** “[I]magine the real suffering and grief of people in other countries. The best way to begin a war on terrorism might be to look in the mirror.”

11. **Speaker at Haverford College meeting:** “We are complicit.”

12. **Michael Rothschild, Dean of the Woodrow Wilson School, Princeton University:** “There is a terrible and understandable desire to find and punish whoever was responsible for this. But as we think about it, it’s very important for Americans to think about our own history, what we did in World War II to Japanese citizens by interning them.”

13. **Barbara Foley, professor of English, Rutgers University:** “[W]e should be aware that, whatever its proximate cause, its ultimate cause is the fascism of U.S. foreign policy over the past many decades.”

14. **Richard Berthold, professor of history, University of New Mexico:** “Anyone who can blow up the Pentagon gets my vote.” Berthold later apologized for making the comment.

15. “How to organize actions against war”—**teach-in sponsored by Political Science and Geography Departments, University of North Carolina-Chapel Hill.**

16. “Anti-Americanism and anti-war sentiment raged yesterday during a ‘teach-in’ at **City College of New York**. The vast majority of the students and professors who spoke at the session, attended by about 200 people, ranted against any American military action—some of them even blaming the United States for the World Trade Center disaster.”

17. **Journalist William Blum at University of North Carolina teach-in:** “If I were the president, I would first apologize to all the widows and orphans, the tortured and the impoverished, and all the millions of other victims of American imperialism.” “[T]here are few if any nations in the world that have harbored more terrorists than the United States.”

18. **David Horn, student at University of Michigan and columnist, Michigan Daily:** “...the actions taken by the terrorists on Tuesday are not completely unwarranted. We try to forget about the way this country behaves internationally—that we too often behave as terrorists.”

19. **Jesse Jackson, speech at Harvard Law School:** “[We should] build bridges and relationships, not simply bombs and walls.”

20. The **University of Massachusetts** grants a permit for a student rally to protest any use of force in waging the war against terrorism. The University revokes a permit allowing a rally in support of America’s policy. The students hold the rally and materials are vandalized with impunity.

21. **Kathryn Duke, student, Duke University and columnist for The Chronicle:** “The words ‘freedom,’ ‘liberty,’ and ‘democracy’ are great words. But when they are used by the media to summon a nationalism so potentially destructive as that being bred now—the sight of the flag burning would be preferable to me to its display across America, across the hearts of Americans.”

22. **Wayne O’Neil, professor of linguistics, MIT:** “What the U.S. calls counter-terrorism is terrorism by another name. Operation Infinite Justice—the Bush administration’s code name for proposed military action against terrorists—is ‘cowboy law.’”

23. **Verdell DeYarman at University of Wisconsin-Milwaukee protest:** “It disturbs me to see all the flags out supporting the slaughter.”

24. **Chairman of the College of Holy Cross Department of Sociology** demands that a secretary remove an American flag hung in memory of her friend Todd Beamer. She refuses and the Chairman removes the flag himself. After unfavorable publicity, the College apologizes but the flag is moved to the Department of Psychology.

25. **Adam Goldstein, former Campus Relations Committee chairman, University of Wisconsin-Madison in a letter-to-the-editor in the Badger Herald:** “...before you preach at us about the evil terrorists, why don’t you try getting your facts straight and face up to the reality that our leaders are war criminals just as much as people like Hitler, Stalin, and other monsters of the 20th century.”

26. **Pomona College, faculty panel discussing U.S. obligations in the Mideast:** “[B]reak the cycle of violence.”

27. **Jerry Irish, professor of religious studies, Pomona College:** “We have to learn to use courage for peace instead of war.”

28. **Sunera Thobani, assistant professor of women's studies, University of British Columbia:** “[The U.S. Government is] the most dangerous global force [with a] foreign policy ... soaked in blood. [War against Afghanistan is] patriarchal racist violence.”

29. **Noam Chomsky at MIT:** “[T]he only way we can put a permanent end to terrorism is to stop participating in it.”

30. “What do we want? Peace! When do we want it? Now!”—**chant at Harvard Rally, Sept. 20, 2001**

31. **San Diego State** formally accuses an international student of abusive behavior and warns that “future incidents [will result in] serious disciplinary sanctions” when the student takes issue with students who cheer the terrorist attacks.

32. **Tim McCarthy, Harvard lecturer in history and literature:** “[I deplore those] who are deploying rhetoric and deploying troops without thinking before they speak.”

33. “An eye for an eye leaves the world blind.”—**Molly McOwen '02, Harvard University, holding sign at peace rally, Sept. 20, 2001**

34. **Howard Zinn, professor emeritus, Boston University:** “[O]ur security can only come by using our national wealth, not for guns, planes, and bombs, but for the health and welfare of our people, and for people suffering in other countries.”

35. **William O. Beeman, professor of anthropology, Brown University:** “A despicable act of mayhem such as those committed in New York and Washington is a measure of the revulsion that others feel at our actions that seemingly limit those rights [to self-determination]. If we perpetuate a cycle of hate and revenge, this conflict will escalate into a war that our great-grandchildren will be fighting.”

36. **Strobe Talbott, Director of the Yale Center for the Study of Globalization:** “It is from the desperate, angry and bereaved that these suicide pilots came.”

37. **Neta Crawford, visiting associate professor (research) at the Thomas J. Watson Jr. Institute for International Studies, Brown University; assistant professor of political science, University of Massachusetts-Amherst:** “We would justifiably resent attacks on New York or Boston in retaliation for those cities ‘harboring’ IRA terrorists. ...

The responsible thing for the President and Congress to do would be to lower the rhetorical temperature in Washington and halt the contest to sound more bellicose and patriotic than the last politician or official....”

38. **Douglas J. Bennet, President, to Students, Alumni, Parents and Friends of Wesleyan:** “... Disparities and injustices are there, all the more intolerable because they are embedded in some of the most fundamental aspects of our society and the world we live in. Addressing these disparities and injustices will not be possible if the world community continues to block its own progress and destroy its people in conflicts generated by prejudice and hatred.

In this time of crisis, we have an unusual opportunity to see past stereotypes, identify and diminish our own prejudices, and experience a complex world through the sensitivities of others....”

39. **Daniel Rothman '04, Brown University:** “It’s good for the government to know that there are people who want peace instead of bloodshed. Not all Americans want revenge.”

40. **Taniq Banuri, Stockholm Environment Institute at Brown University panel discussion:** “Many terrorists get their start being pushed around by a bus driver or abused by a police officer just because they are different.”

41. **David Kertzer, professor of anthropology, Brown University:** “[The Pentagon] represents America’s impregnable right.”

42. **George Borts, professor of economics, Brown University:** “If people have some patriotic fervor, they are going to have to work for the CIA, slitting throats in dark alleys.”

43. **Brown University:** “Some 120 students walked out of class and gathered on the Main Green to protest U.S. military strikes in Afghanistan. At least two professors dismissed class early to allow students to attend.”

44. “One, two, three, four—we don’t want a racist war.”—**chant at Brown University war protest.**

45. **Shaun Joseph ’02, Brown University:** “We cannot simply go on with our daily routines as our country prosecutes an unjust war. Students are walking out in solidarity with the people of Afghanistan who must now suffer the double burden of a dictatorial regime and American bombs.”

46. **Brian Rainey ’04, Brown University:** “To call this a just war is to ignore the mountain of injustice it is based on. People are just drunk on the cheap jingoism of the media and politicians.”

47. **76 University of California-Berkeley** professors joined with 100 other academics in an advertisement in the *New York Times*, calling the war unacceptable.

48. **Professional Staff Congress, City University of New York:** “[Students and teachers] do not need to be fighting against fellow-workers under other flags and gods but rather against their own corporate or government employers, as we are at CUNY.” The Professional Staff Congress is the union that represents the faculty and staff of the City University of New York. The City

University of New York is the largest public urban university in the country.

49. **Wasima Alikhan, Islamic Academy of Las Vegas:** “[I]gnorance breeds hate.”

50. **David Coleman, student, University of Oklahoma:** “[I]ntolerance breeds hate, hate breeds violence and violence breeds death, destruction and heartache.”

51. “Hate breeds hate.”—**sign at University of Maryland**

52. “An eye for an eye makes the world blind.”—**sign at University of North Carolina-Chapel Hill**

53. **Ivy League student:** “What you have to look at is the underlying reasons. Poverty breeds resentment and resentment breeds anger.”

54. **Brown student activist:** “I consider myself a patriot. I think this country does wonderful things for its citizens, but we must acknowledge the terrible things it often does to the citizens of other countries.”

55. **Bill Crain, professor of psychology, City College of New York:** “Our diplomacy is horrible.” Mr. Crain later told the *Chronicle of Higher Education* that his remarks were distorted: “I said U.S. alliances have shifted. We support one person, and then another, but the constant is violence. We need to address that and work for peace.”

56. **Eric Foner, professor of history, Columbia University:** “I’m not sure which is more frightening: the horror that engulfed New York City or the apocalyptic rhetoric emanating daily from the White House.”

57. **Unidentified speaker at Haverford College Quaker Meeting:** “No matter how desolate the World Trade Center site was, there was a place even more desolate—Afghanistan.”

58. More than 100 students protest and demand a front-page apology and greater Arab and Muslim representation after student editors at the **University of California-Berkeley Daily Californian** publish a cartoon. The cartoon shows two bearded men wearing turbans and long robes, standing in what appears to be hell saying: “We made it to paradise! Now we will meet Allah, and be fed grapes, and be serviced by 70 virgin women, and...”

59. **The UC Berkeley Student Senate** adopts a resolution, 11-7, demanding a front-page apology and diversity training for staff members. Student senate member Jessica Quindel tells the *Contra Costa Times*: “It’s not about being offended. It’s about the implications of [running] an inflammatory cartoon at a time when there had already been more than 1,000 hate crimes against the communities depicted. Racism is not an American right.”

The editorial board issued a statement saying it would not apologize since the cartoon fell within the realm of fair political commentary.

60. **UC Berkeley Student Senate member Sajid Khan said:** “[Although the cartoon] did not outright call for violence, it promoted and perpetuated the same ignorance and intolerance that has led to the death of many across our nation.”

61. **UC Berkeley Student Senate** proposes raising the school newspaper’s rent after it runs a controversial cartoon.

62. **Faculty forum on alternative to war, Washington University of St. Louis:** “[T]he United States would have done the right thing [by not going to war]: responding as a responsi-

ble member of the international community rather than as a vigilante gunslinger in the old West, riding out to capture the bad guys and bring them back dead or alive.”

63. **Barbara Corrado Pope, professor emerita of women’s studies, University of Oregon:** “[W]e need to hear more than one perspective on how we can make the world a safer place. We need to understand the reasons behind the terrifying hatred directed against the United States and find ways to act that will not foment more hatred for generations to come.”

64. **Richard Falk, Princeton University emeritus professor, at town meeting:** “[D]emocracies, because they have a sense of self-pride and moral consciousness, can often act without restraint and be destructive of the values they are trying to promote. The thinking is to find the perpetrators and engage in a military response and feel that that solves something. But there needs to be an understanding of why this kind of suicidal violence could be undertaken against our country.”

65. “Our grief is not a cry for war.”—**poster at New York University**

66. “Recycle plastic, not violence.”—**poster at Hunter College**

67. **Jack Kyung, student, Hunter College:** “A lot of people are saying we created this monster. What goes around comes around. People are forgetting about the past.”

68. **Todd Gitlin, professor of communications, New York University:** “There is a lot of skepticism about the administration’s policy of going to war.”

69. **Amonika Kumar, student, Columbia University:** “[It is] ridiculous for us to go and kill more people because of what Bin Laden did.”

70. **Chanting Students, University of Michigan:** “No racist scapegoating, no racist war, we won’t take it anymore.”

71. **Sarah Norr, junior at Wesleyan University:** “For this to turn into an excuse to have a war and kill more people, it seemed like it would just be too horrible.”

72. **Harvard Sign:** “War Is Also Terrorism.”

73. **Student Protestors in Harvard Square:** “One, two, three, four—we don’t want another war! Five, six, seven, eight—stop the violence, stop the hate!”

74. **Jean Jackson, professor of anthropology, MIT:** “To declare war, in this case, is a dangerous use of metaphoric language: it dignifies terrorist acts and implies a war with terrorists could end with a peace treaty. We must resist calls for revenge or retaliation.”

75. **“Students at several colleges** walked out of classes and held protests Monday in response to U.S. military actions in Afghanistan. The rallies—at Bryn Mawr and Haverford Colleges, the University of California at Berkeley, and Wesleyan University—attracted hundreds of students although many students did not attend or held counter-protests backing the government’s response to last month’s terrorist attacks.”

76. **Signs at the University of Michigan:** “Revenge Is Not Justifiable” and “No Racist War.”

77. **Fred Hitz, Director of the project on international intelligence, Woodrow Wilson School’s Center of International Studies, Princeton University:** “We need to think about what could have produced the frustrations that caused these crimes. To have that kind of hatred is a phenomenon we will have to try to understand.”

78. **Rania Masri, speaking at “Understanding the Attack on America: an Alternate View,” University of North Carolina–Chapel Hill, Sept. 17, 2001:** “The question we should explore is not who we should bomb or where we should bomb, but why we were targeted. When we have the answer to why, then we will have the ability to prevent terrorist attacks tomorrow.”

79. **Elin O’Hara Slavick, professor of art, University of North Carolina-Chapel Hill,** shows a slide show of her artwork, “Places the United States has Bombed” at a teach-in entitled: “What is war? What is peace?” The teach-in then divides into workshops: US Foreign Policy; Civil Rights in Time of War; Action Through Non-Violence; How to Organize Actions Against War; The Role of Armed Resistance; Community, Networking, and Outreach; Visual Strategies for Peace During War, and Arguments for Peace.

80. On Oct. 4, at the **University of North Carolina-Chapel Hill, Campus Y, the Division of Student Affairs, and Sangam** (South Asian awareness group), sponsors Arun Gandhi, grandson of Mahatma Gandhi. Gandhi reiterates what he had written earlier: “We must acknowledge our role in helping to create monsters in the world, find ways to contain these monsters without hurting more innocent people and then redefine our role in the world.”

81. **Christopher Phelps, professor of history, Ohio State University:** “[I am] wary of wars framed for freedom, which in general have produced the exact opposite effect. ... [D]uring the cold war, the ‘Communist menace’ became the basis for hysterical McCarthyist attacks on civil liberties.”

82. **David P. Barash, professor of psychology, University of Washington:** “[M]any people consider the United States to be a terrorist state.”

83. **Joel Beinin, professor, Stanford University:** “If Osama Bin Laden is confirmed to be behind the attacks, the United States should bring him before an international tribunal on charges of crimes against humanity.”

84. **Journalist William Blum at University of North Carolina teach-in:** “These acts of terrorism will not stop as long as we are intervening in civil wars that are none of our business besides serving the interests of U.S. corporations.”

85. **Catherine Lutz, professor of anthropology, University of North Carolina:** “The parallel to [September 11] is not Pearl Harbor. It is February 1947, when a new war was declared.” “Hunting the terrorists from their holes [reminds me] of the racial hatred that has preceded, stoked, and been inflamed by nearly every one of the 20th century’s wars.”

86. **Luke Massie, University of Michigan student member of the Coalition to Defend Affirmative Action and Integration and Fight for Equality By Any Means Necessary:** “We’re linking the fight against racism against a racist war abroad.”

87. **Penn State University Vice Provost** informs a faculty member that his web page advocating military action against terrorists is “insensitive and perhaps even intimidating.” “Intimidating” expression is grounds for dismissal at Penn State. Penn State President Graham Spanier later denies that the use of the term “intimidating” in any manner chilled the professor’s free speech.

88. **Duke University** shuts down a faculty member website after he promotes vigorous military action as a response to terrorist attacks. After public uproar, the University reinstates the website but insists that the faculty member add a disclaimer that the views expressed in the article do not reflect the view of the University. Duke has never before required any such disclaimer.

89. **Jim Casteleiro, freshman at Oberlin College:** “War created people like Osama bin Laden, and more war will create more people like him.”

90. **Jennie Traschen, professor of physics, University of Massachusetts-Amherst on Sept. 10:** “[The American flag is] a symbol of terrorism and death and fear and destruction and oppression.”

91. **Kayla Monroe, part-time student, University of California-Berkeley:** “The media has stirred the country into a froth of hatred and revenge. All this so-called support for military action has been completely manufactured. I don’t know anyone who thinks it would be a good idea.”

92. **Journalist William Blum at University of North Carolina teach-in:** “... I would announce that America’s global interventions had come to an end. I would then reduce the military budget by at least 90 percent and I would use the savings to pay the reparations to our victims and to increase social services.”

93. **Florida Gulf Coast Dean of Library Services Kathleen Hoeth** instructs her employees to remove stickers saying “Proud to be an American” on the grounds that they may offend international students. After public pressure, President William Merwin revokes the policy.

94. **Clement Henry, professor of government, University of Texas–Austin:** “The United States policies toward the region, especially over the past 10 years (have) engendered serious grievances. Our actions were looking to much of Arab and Muslim public opinion like a re-edition of 19th century imperialism.”

95. **Robert Jensen, professor of journalism, University of Texas–Austin:** “My anger on this day is directed not only at individuals who engineered the September 11 tragedy but at those

who have held power in the United States and have engineered attacks on civilians every bit as tragic.” “[The terrorist attack] was no more despicable than the massive acts of terrorism ... that the U.S. government has committed during my lifetime.”

96. **Josh Timmerle, student, Oxnard College:** “I’ll pretend I’m gay. I’m against war. It’s scary.”

97. **Paul Kennedy, professor of history, Yale University:** “How do we appear to them, and what would it be like were our places in the world reversed?” “Suppose that there existed today a powerful, unified Arab-Muslim state that stretched from Algeria to Turkey and Arabia. In those conditions, would not many Americans steadily grow to loathe that colossus?”

98. **Catherine Lutz, professor of anthropology, University of North Carolina:** “If one [of the perpetrators] is Osama Bin Laden, send the international police for him and pick up Henry Kissinger and Augusto Pinochet on the way home.”

99. **Haunani-Kay Trask, professor of Hawaiian studies, University of Hawaii:** “The United States is angry because somebody came back and blew up their World Trade Center. I would be angry, too. But what made them do that? It is the history of terrorism that the United States unleashes against native people all over the world. ... Everywhere, the United States has overthrown leftist government. Everywhere, the United States has overthrown native governments. Why should we support the United States, whose hands in history are soaked with blood?”

100. **Charles Kurzman, professor of sociology, University of North Carolina:** “We’re ... playing into the hands of our own militarists, whose interests always lie, I believe, in the exaggeration of threats, armed responses, and so on. In fact, I would argue that there is tacit collusion among the militarists of all sides.”

101. **Orange Coast Community College** suspends Professor Kenneth W. Hearlson after several Muslim students complain they were called terrorists when Hearlson lectured that silence on crimes against Christians and Jews in the Middle East was consent to terrorism.

102. **Administrator at Central Michigan University** tells students to remove patriotic posters (an American flag, eagle) from their dormitory on the grounds that they are “offensive.”

103. **Group at Amherst College:** “The United States of America is built upon a history of violence and repression. This began with the genocide of Native Americans who inhabited this land before the arrival of European colonizers and it continued as Black people were brought here as slaves to provide the labor necessary for the country’s development. ... The construction and maintenance of America depends on the marginalization and exploitation of those excluded.”

104. **Troy, student, University of California-Berkeley:** “I care about the anti-war movement to an extent, but I don’t see how that’s gonna stop crazy George Bush from going to war. He wouldn’t even help us out with the energy crisis, so why would he give a damn about a few sons and daughters of hippies and Black Panthers protesting?”

105. **Joseph L. Bittenwieser, professor of social science, Columbia University:** “Contingent Predictions: ... Bombing the presumed originator(s) of Tuesday’s attacks and forcing other countries to choose sides will therefore aggravate the very conditions American leaders will declare they are preventing. ... If so, democracy (defined as relatively broad and equal citizenship, binding consultation of citizens, and protection from arbitrary actions by governmental agents) will decline across the world.”

106. **Nuriel Heckler, sophomore at City College of New York:** “We don’t feel military action will stop terrorism, but it will lead to racism and hate.”

107. **Panelist Stan Goff, University of North Carolina teach-in:** “The de facto executive branch and the compliant press are putting the historical spotlight right now on December 7, 1941, and Pearl Harbor. I think we need to aim that spotlight at February 27 in 1933 and the Reichstag fire.”

108. **Walter Daum, mathematics instructor, at CUNY teach-in:** “American imperialism is responsible for this terrorist attack.”

109. **Carmen Candia, senior at Georgetown University School of Foreign Service:** “The United States has to realize that what it’s doing with its foreign policy is just as bad, at least, as what happened last week [Sept. 11].”

110. **CUNY Forum:** “It was a two-hour, hard-core America bashing festival. The terrorist attack on the trade center was referred to by faculty as ‘the incident.’ Terrorists were described as freedom fighters. One anthropology professor, M.A. Samad-Matias, framed the atrocity as an understandable Islamic response to Western imperialism.” “Student government leader Kenneth Williams said African-Americans should be suspicious of ‘rallying around the flag’ and becoming ‘tools of the ruling class’ in a war.”

111. **Wayne O’Neil, professor of linguistics, MIT:** “[Americans should] bring ourselves and our country to justice, not just the perpetrators.”

112. “Stop the violence, stop the hate.”—**chant at the University of California-Berkeley.**

113. **Dominique, 22-year-old student at the University of California-Berkeley:** “The main issue is racism in general.”

114. **Senwung Luk, student, Yale University:** “Just because a grotesque act was committed against this country, does not mean any response is justified; it does not grant this country special license to use the sword.”

115. **University of California-Berkeley:** “[M]ilitary uniforms were burned in effigy and faculty members conducted classes outside to protest the war.”

116. **Johns Hopkins Dean Stephen Szabo** demands a written apology and removes professor Charles H. Fairbanks from his position as director of the Central Asia-Caucasus Institute as unfit after Fairbanks supports an aggressive campaign against states that harbor terrorists and bets “a Koran” that his analysis is correct. After a public outcry, the dean reverses his decision.

117. At **Williams College**, a student organizes a public recitation of the Pledge of Allegiance in honor of a Williams graduate who died in the September 22 attack. President Morton Schapiro urges the entire university to attend. Over two hundred students as well as maintenance and cafeteria staff attend. Only two faculty appear: the president and head of the Art Department.

Campus Responses—Sources

1. Speaker at Open Mic sponsored by Not Another Victim Anywhere. “Students, profs walk out of class to protest air strikes,” by Andy Golodny, *Brown Daily Herald*, Oct. 10, 2001
2. “Forum Denounces Military Retaliation,” by Brook Corwin, *The Daily Tar Heel*, Sept. 18, 2001
3. Id.
4. “Terror War against the Superpower,” by Kevin Lourie, Op-ed distributed by the Brown University News Service, Sept. 25, 2001
5. “Panel: Historical Mistreatment of Pakistan, Afghanistan May Hurt US,” by Anthony Bongiorno, *Brown Daily Herald*, Sept. 28, 2001
6. “Students, profs walk out of class to protest air strikes,” by Andy Golodny, *Brown Daily Herald*, Oct. 10, 2001
7. “CUNY Chancellor, Trustees Denounce Professors Who Criticized U.S. Policy After Attacks,” by Robin Wilson, *Chronicle of Higher Education*, Oct. 5, 2001
8. “Towers of Intellect,” by James Bowman, *Wall Street Journal*, Oct. 5, 2001
9. “Flags-on-Buses Flap Is Glimpse into Academia’s Values,” special by Charles D. Snelling, *The (Allentown, PA) Morning Call*, Sept. 22, 2001
10. “Students Rally for Peace on McDermott Court,” MIT News Office, Sept. 20, 2001
11. “Campus Culture Wars Flare Anew Over Tenor of Debate After the Attacks,” by Anemona Hartocollis, *New York Times*, Sept. 30, 2001
12. “University Community Tries to Understand, Cope with Tragedy,” posted Sept. 11, 2001, www.princeton.edu/webannouncement
13. “Towers of Intellect,” by James Bowman, *Wall Street Journal*, Oct. 5, 2001; “Wing With No Prayer,” by Andrew Sullivan at www.andrewsullivan.com, Oct. 4, 2001
14. “Code Red Herring,” *Washington Bulletin*: National Review’s Internet Update for October 1, 2001
15. “Taxpayers Forced to Subsidize Lunacy,” by John Hood, *The (Jacksonville, NC) Daily News*, Sept. 28, 2001
16. “CCNY Bashes America – Students, Profs Blame Attacks on US,” *New York Post*, Oct. 3, 2001
17. “America’s Enemies Rally at UNC-Chapel Hill,” *FrontPageMagazine.com*, Sept. 21, 2001; “The New Anti-Americanism of the Academic Left” by Candace de Russy and Winfield Myers, *FrontPageMagazine.com*, Sept. 28, 2001; Young America’s Foundation Press Release, “Blame America First’ Fad Prominent on Campus,” Oct. 3, 2001
18. Young America’s Foundation Press Release, “Blame America First’ Fad Prominent on Campus,” Oct. 3, 2001
19. Id.
20. Foundation for Individual Rights in Education website, www.thefire.org, FIRE and the aftermath of September 11
21. Young America’s Foundation Press Release, “Blame America First’ Fad Prominent on Campus,” Oct. 3, 2001
22. “Students Rally for Peace on McDermott Court,” MIT News Office, Sept. 20, 2001
23. Young America’s Foundation Press Release, “Blame America First’ Fad Prominent on Campus,” Oct. 3, 2001
24. Foundation for Individual Rights in Education website, www.thefire.org; “Campuses See a Downside to Unity,” by David Abel, *Boston Globe*, Oct. 6, 2001
25. Young America’s Foundation, Press Release, “Blame America First’ Fad Prominent on Campus,” Oct. 3, 2001

26. "Professors Discuss US Obligations in Mid-East," by Laurel Bellante in *The Student Life*, Pomona College, Oct. 12, 2001
27. Id.
28. "Free Speech Protects All Speech," by Wendy McElroy, www.foxnews.com, Oct. 16, 2001
29. "Chomsky Discusses Terrorism," by Maral Shamloo, *The (Massachusetts Institute of Technology) Tech*, Oct. 19, 2001
30. "Peace rally draws few students," *Harvard University Gazette*, Sept. 27, 2001
31. "Student: Attack Praised," (San Diego State University) *Daily Aztec*, Oct. 17, 2001; Foundation for Individual Rights in Education website, www.thefire.org
32. "Peace rally draws few students," *Harvard University Gazette*, Sept. 27, 2001
33. Photo, *Harvard University Gazette*, Sept. 20, 2001
34. "Towers of Intellect," by James Bowman, *Wall Street Journal*, Oct. 5, 2001
35. "Understanding Osama Bin Laden," by William O. Beeman, Op-ed distributed by the Brown University News Service, Sept. 13, 2001
36. "Range of Professors on Panel Not Diverse Enough," by Professor Donald Kagan, *Yale Daily News*, Sept. 18, 2001
37. "Fear Itself-Why Retaliation Doesn't Work," by Neta Crawford, Op-ed distributed by the Brown University News Service, Sept. 24, 2001
38. News and Announcements for the Greater Wesleyan Community, Wesleyan website, Sept. 14, 2001
39. "Amid Concern Over Threat of War, Students Scrawl Worries Across Main Green Display," by Andy Golodny, *Brown Daily Herald*, Sept. 18, 2001
40. "Panel: Historical Mistreatment of Pakistan, Afghanistan May Hurt US," by Anthony Bongiorno, *Brown Daily Herald*, Sept. 28, 2001
41. "Brown Profs See Need for Restraint in US Response," by Bethany Rallis, *Brown Daily Herald*, Sept. 17, 2001
42. "Brown Profs Liken Attack to Pearl Harbor, JFK Assassination," by Elena Lesley, *Brown Daily Herald*, Sept. 20, 2001
43. "Students, Profs walk out of class to protest air strikes," by Andy Golodny, *Brown Daily Herald*, Oct. 10, 2001
44. Id.
45. Id.
46. Id.
47. "Turning On and Tuning Out," FrontPageMagazine.com, Sept. 27, 2001, quoting *The Daily Californian*
48. Excerpts from statement of Professional Staff Congress, City University of New York, quoted by Universal Press Syndicated columnist John Leo in "Good sense and nonsense vie for campus supremacy," Oct. 8, 2001
49. "Pacifists ill-breeding scorns actual people," *National Post*, Oct. 4, 2001
50. Id.
51. Id.
52. "Forum Denounces Military Retaliation," by Brook Corwin, *The Daily Tar Heel*, Sept. 18, 2001

53. "Pacifists ill-breeding scorns actual people," *National Post*, Oct. 4, 2001
54. Reader Comments to Gabe Part 2, posted Oct. 10, 2001 by a "student activist," *Brown Daily Herald* website
55. "CUNY Chancellor, Trustees Denounce Professors Who Criticized U.S. Policy After Attacks," *Chronicle of Higher Education*, Oct. 5, 2001
56. "Maddening Deeds at U.S. Universities," by William J. Bennett," *Boston Globe*, Nov. 4, 2001
57. "Campus Culture Wars Flare Anew Over Tenor of Debate After the Attacks," by Anemona Hartocollis, *New York Times*, Sept. 30, 2001
58. "Cartoon in Berkeley Paper Sparks Protests and Campus Debate," *Chronicle of Higher Education*, *Today's News*, Sept. 20, 2001
59. "UC Berkeley Paper Came Under Fire for Printing a Cartoon that Some Considered Racist," by Tom Lochner, *Contra Costa Times*, Oct. 14, 2001
60. Id.
61. TRB from Washington, by Peter Beinart, *The New Republic*, Oct. 22, 2001
62. "Faculty Forum Addresses Alternatives to War," by Allison Barrett, (Washington University of St. Louis) *Student Life*, Oct. 19, 2001
63. "Faculty Group to Conduct Teach-In," by Greg Bolt, *The (Eugene, OR) Register-Guard*, Oct. 2, 2001
64. "University Community Tries to Understand, Cope with Tragedy," posted Oct. 11, 2001, www.princeton.edu/webannouncement
65. "War Talk Stirs Up College Campuses," by Joanne Wasserman, *New York Daily News*, Sept. 21, 2001
66. Id.
67. Id.
68. Id.
69. Id.
70. "Students Rally Against New War – Peaceful Confrontation Encouraged at U-M," by Shantee Woodards and Santiago Esparza, *The Detroit News*, Sept. 21, 2001
71. "After the Attack: The Campuses," *Los Angeles Times*, Sept. 21, 2001
72. Id.
73. Id.
74. "Students Rally for Peace on McDermott Court," MIT News Service, Sept. 20, 2001
75. "Students Protest and Show Support for U.S. Military Strikes in Afghanistan," by Dana Mulhauser, *Chronicle of Higher Education*, Oct. 9, 2001
76. "Students Rally Against New War," *The Detroit News*, Sept. 21, 2001
77. "University Community Tries to Understand, Cope with Tragedy," posted Oct. 11, 2001, www.princeton.edu/webannouncement
78. "Forum Denounces Military Retaliation," by Brook Corwin, *The Daily Tar Heel*, Sept. 18, 2001; "The New Anti-Americanism of the Academic Left" by Candace de Russy and Winfield Myers, *FrontPageMagazine.com*, Sept. 28, 2001
79. "Taxpayers Forced to Subsidize Lunacy," by John Hood, *The (Jacksonville, NC) Daily News*, Sept. 28, 2001
80. Id.

81. "Towers of Intellect," by James Bowman, *Wall Street Journal*, Oct. 5, 2001
82. Id.
83. "Turning On and Tuning Out," FrontPageMagazine.com, Sept. 27, 2001, citing *San Jose Mercury News*
84. "Forum Denounces Military Retaliation," by Brook Corwin, *The Daily Tar Heel*, Sept. 18, 2001; "The New Anti-Americanism of the Academic Left," by Candace de Russy and Winfield Myers, FrontPageMagazine.com, Sept. 28, 2001
85. "Towers of Intellect," *Wall Street Journal*, Oct. 5, 2001
86. "Protesters Rally to Stop War," by Karen Schwartz, *The Michigan Daily*, Sept. 21, 2001
87. TRB from Washington, by Peter Beinart, *The New Republic*, Oct. 22, 2001; Foundation for Individual Rights in Education website, www.thefire.org
88. Foundation for Individual Rights in Education website, www.thefire.org
89. "Student Activists Call for Peace, Not Retaliation," by Sabrina Eaton, *The Cleveland Plain Dealer*, Sept. 21, 2001
90. "Towers of Intellect," by James Bowman, *Wall Street Journal*, Oct. 5, 2001
91. "New Generation Confronts Notions of War and Peace as Their World Changes," *New York Times*, Sept. 21, 2001
92. "America's Enemies Rally at UNC-Chapel Hill," FrontPageMagazine.com, Sept. 21, 2001
93. Foundation for Individual Rights In Education website, www.thefire.org
94. "Turning On and Tuning Out," by Jennifer Kabbany, FrontPageMagazine.com, Sept. 27, 2001
95. "Code Red Herring," *Washington Bulletin: National Review's Internet Update* for October 1, 2001; "Towers of Intellect," *Wall Street Journal*, Oct. 5, 2001
96. "After the Attack: The Campuses," *Los Angeles Times*, Sept. 25, 2001
97. "Campus Culture Wars Flare Anew Over Tenor of Debate after Attacks," *New York Times*, Sept. 30, 2001, quoting Professor Kennedy at a campus forum; "CUNY Chief Repudiates Forum Remarks," by Anemona Hartocollis, *New York Times*, Oct. 4, 2001
98. "America's Enemies Rally at UNC-Chapel Hill," FrontPageMagazine.com, Sept. 21, 2001
99. Quoted in the *Honolulu Star-Bulletin* and cited in opinionjournal@wsj.com, Oct. 24, 2001
100. "America's Enemies Rally at UNC-Chapel Hill," FrontPageMagazine.com, Sept. 21, 2001
101. TRB from Washington, by Peter Beinart, *The New Republic*, Oct. 22, 2001; Foundation for Individual Rights in Education website, www.thefire.org
102. Id.
103. Posted on a website called Daily Jolt and cited in opinionjournal@wsj.com, Oct. 24, 2001
104. "Racial Justice – Behind Today's Campus Anti-War Activism," by Russell Morse, Pacific News Service, Oct. 16, 2001, www.alternet.org/wiretapmag/story
105. "A Columbia Professor's Dire Predictions about Terrorist Attack," The word.hunter.cuny.edu/news/terror (listserv)
106. "CCNY Bashes America – Students, Profs Blame Attacks on US," *New York Post*, Oct. 3, 2001
107. "America's Enemies Rally at UNC-Chapel Hill," FrontPageMagazine.com, Sept. 21, 2001

108. "CCNY Bashes America – Students, Profs Blame Attacks on US," *New York Post*, Oct. 3, 2001
109. "On Campuses Across U.S., Students Hold Rallies for Peace, Drawing Mixed Responses," *Chronicle of Higher Education*, Sept. 21, 2001
110. "CUNY Vows Crackdown on Anti-US Hatefest," by Andrea Peyser, *New York Post*, Oct. 4, 2001; "CCNY Bashes America – Students, Profs Blame Attacks on US," *New York Post*, Oct. 3, 2001
111. Young America's Foundation Press Release, "Blame America First' Fad Prominent," Oct. 3, 2001
112. "Racial Justice – Behind Today's Campus Anti-War Activism," by Russell Morse, Pacific News Service, Oct. 16, 2001, www.alternet.org/wiretapmag/story
113. Id.
114. "U.S. Must Not Continue Cycle of Violence," by Senwung Luk, *Yale Herald*, Sept. 14, 2001
115. "Turning On and Tuning Out," FrontPageMagazine.com, Sept. 27, 2001, quoting *The Daily Californian*
116. TRB from Washington, by Peter Beinart, *The New Republic*, Oct. 22, 2001; Foundation for Individual Rights in Education website, www.thefire.org
117. "Maddening Deeds at U.S. Universities," by William J. Bennett, *Boston Globe*, Nov. 4, 2001, citing *Commentary Magazine*